

Minute

Planning Committee

Tuesday, 9 June 2020, 10:30.

Microsoft Teams.



Present

Councillors Robin W Crichton, John A R Scott, Alexander G Cowie, Norman R Craigie, David Dawson, Barbara Foulkes, Stephen Sankey, Magnus O Thomson, Owen Tierney and Duncan A Tullock.

Clerk

- Hazel Flett, Senior Committees Officer.

In Attendance

- Roddy Mackay, Head of Planning, Development and Regulatory Services.
- Jamie Macvie, Planning Manager (Development Management).
- Georgette Herd, Solicitor.
- Donald Wilson, Roads Authority Officer.

Observing

- David Barclay, Senior Planner (Development Management).
- Susan Shearer, Senior Planner (Development and Marine Planning).
- Paul Turner, Environmental Health Officer.
- Kirsty Groundwater, Project Officer (Communications and Engagement).

Declarations of Interest

- No declarations of interest were intimated.

Chair

- Councillor Robin W Crichton.

1. Suspension of Standing Orders

The Committee **suspended Standing Order 8.11** to enable members to participate in the meeting from a remote location, as a party had the right to be heard in person or through a representative and the decision to be made was as a result of a quasi-judicial or regulatory hearings process, such as a planning application or an appeal.

2. Form of Voting

The Committee resolved that, should a vote be required in respect of the planning application to be considered at this meeting, notwithstanding Standing Order 21.4, the form of voting should be by calling the roll or recorded vote.

3. Planning Application 19/143/PPMAJ

Proposed Extension of Quarry, Continued Extraction of Stone, Restoration and Landscaping at Cursiter Quarry, Old Finstown Road, Firth

Fraser Blackwood, agent representing the applicant, Orkney Islands Council, was present during consideration of this item.

Darren Richardson, David Custer and Steve Killeen, representing the applicant, Orkney Islands Council, were present during consideration of this item.

George Brown, Andrew Giggle, John Grimond and Kenny Slater, objectors, were present during consideration of this item.

After consideration of a report by the Executive Director of Development and Infrastructure, copies of which had been circulated, and after hearing a report from the Planning Manager (Development Management), the Committee:

Noted:

3.1. That letters of objection relating to the application for planning permission in respect of the proposal for the extension of a quarry, continued extraction of stone, restoration and landscaping at Cursiter Quarry, Old Finstown Road, Firth, had been received from the following:

- George Brown, Rohallion, Grimbister.
- Andrew Giggle, Rossmyre, Grimbister.
- John Grimond, Old Manse of Firth, Grimbister.
- K A Slater, The Glebe, Grimbister.

After hearing representations from George Brown, Andrew Giggle, John Grimond and Kenny Slater, objectors, and from Fraser Blackwood, agent for the applicant, Orkney Islands Council, Councillor Robin W Crichton, seconded by Councillor David Dawson, moved that the application for planning permission in respect of the proposal for the extension of a quarry, continued extraction of stone, restoration and landscaping at Cursiter Quarry, Old Finstown Road, Firth, be refused, as, in their opinion:

(1) The scale and extent of the proposed extension to the quarry, which extended beyond the defined Minerals Safeguard Area, was not justified and, in particular, the case had not been made that future need and demand for aggregate could not be met within a defined Minerals Safeguard Area.

(2) The proximity of the proposed extension to residential properties would result in significant adverse cumulative impacts on the residential amenity of the neighbouring properties as a result of noise, dust and vibration from blasting.

(3) There would be an adverse impact on the landscape character and visual amenity of the local area.

(4) There were potential adverse impacts on cultural and natural heritage assets.

(5) Measures proposed were not sufficient to satisfactorily mitigate the impact of the quarry extension on the amenity of neighbouring residents and the wider environment.

And, accordingly, the proposed development was contrary to the following policies of the Orkney Local Development Plan 2017:

- Policy 1 – Criteria for All Development, parts (iii), (iv), (vi), (ix) and (x).
- Policy 2 – Design, parts (i) and (ii).
- Policy 4 – Business, Industry and Employment, section E – Minerals.
- Policy 9 – Natural Heritage and Landscape, section A – Natural Heritage Designations, parts (2) and (3).
- Policy 9 – Natural Heritage and Landscape, section G – Landscape, parts (i) and (ii).

Councillor Barbara Foulkes, seconded by Councillor Stephen Sankey, moved an amendment that the application for planning permission in respect of the proposal for the extension of a quarry, continued extraction of stone, restoration and landscaping at Cursiter Quarry, Old Finstown Road, Firth, be deferred to enable members of the Committee to undertake an unaccompanied site visit.

The result of a recorded vote was as follows:

For the Amendment:

Councillors Alexander G Cowie, Barbara Foulkes, Stephen Sankey, John A R Scott and Magnus Thomson (5).

For the Motion:

Councillors Norman R Craigie, Robin W Crichton, David Dawson, Owen Tierney and Duncan A Tullock (5).

On the casting vote of the Chair, the Committee:

Resolved, in terms of delegated powers:

3.2. That the application for planning permission in respect of the proposal for the extension of a quarry, continued extraction of stone, restoration and landscaping at Cursiter Quarry, Old Finstown Road, Firth, be deferred to enable members of the Committee to undertake an unaccompanied site visit.

4. Conclusion of Meeting

At 12:50 the Chair declared the meeting concluded.

Signed: Rob Crichton.